



**STATE ASSESSORS BOARD
REGULAR MEETING MINUTES OF JULY 14 AND 15, 2008
Fort Holmes Room, Mission Point Resort
Mackinac Island, Michigan**

CALL TO ORDER: The July 14, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board was called to order at 9:05 a.m. in the Fort Holmes Room at the Mission Point Resort, Mackinac Island, Michigan.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Maxine J. McClelland, Member

Member absent: Frederick W. Morgan, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

APPROVAL OF MINUTES: It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the regular meeting minutes of the June 20, 2008 meeting of the State Assessors Board as presented.

PUBLIC COMMENT: There was no public comment.

EDUCATIONAL CREDITS: The recent addition of a posting to the State Assessors Board Web page showing credit toward level 3 and level 4 course requirements received by assessing officers was discussed by the Board.

STATE ASSESSORS BOARD ANNUAL REPORT: It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the 2008 Annual Report of the State Assessors Board as prepared by Chairperson Hobart.

EDUCATIONAL PROGRAMS:

1. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to provide State Assessors Board educational materials and services free of charge to a State Assessors Board staff member.
2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to receive and file evaluations for State Assessors Board Course 2 held in 2008.
3. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to grant approval to the level 3 experience qualification request of Ms. Janice E. Freeman.

CERTIFICATION APPLICANTS: It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to grant formal approval to the list of certification applicants provided to the Board. The list of certification applicants which was approved by the Board and the certification totals presented to the Board were as follows:

**Certification Applicants
July 3, 2008**

Level 1

Anderson, Jessica
Barnett, Linda L.
Davis, Cindy S.
Embs, Gordon D.

Gauthier, Timothy L.
Harrison, Deborah L.
Hart, Susan
Kallas, Christina A.

Shaw, Melanie
Tubergen, Marie
Verburg, Lisa
Yingling, Jennifer D.

Level 2

Gauthier, Timothy L.
Glynn, Michael S.

Nelson, Staci
Nelson, Wayne D.

Vaughan-Williams, Lenise R.
Wasylewski, Anna

Level 3

Johnson, Evan A.

**Certification Totals
July 3, 2008**

Level 1	564
Level 2	928
Level 3	883
Level 4	<u>147</u>
Total	2,522

FIRST CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, Michigan Compiled Law (MCL) 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii), 15.243(1)(d), and 15.243(1)(k) and the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.267(2).) A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and McClelland—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following items:

1. Discussion of the closed meeting minutes from June 20, 2008
2. Discussion of level 2 examination revisions
3. Discussion of June 2008 course examination results
4. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0023
5. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0024
6. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0025
7. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0026
8. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0027

9. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0028

10. Discussion of revocation petition 08-0029

A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and McClelland—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

SECOND CLOSED MEETING: A closed meeting was permissible under the Open Meetings Act, MCL 15.268(h). (See also the Freedom of Information Act, MCL 15.243(1)(b)(ii).) A motion was made by McClelland and seconded by Patel to go into closed session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and McClelland—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

A closed session was held for the following item: discussion of revocation petition 08-0028.

A motion was made by Patel and seconded by McClelland to return to open session. A roll call vote occurred: Hobart—yes, Patel—yes, Allen—yes, and McClelland—yes. The motion was unanimously approved.

OPEN MEETING ACTIONS ON CLOSED MEETING ITEMS:

1. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to adopt the closed meeting minutes of June 20, 2008 as presented.

2. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to approve the revisions to the level 2 examination as presented.

3. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to receive and file the June 2008 course examination results.

4. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0023.

5. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0024 to respond in writing to the first allegation summarized in the communication regarding this matter from the Executive Secretary and to dismiss the second allegation summarized in the communication from the Executive Secretary.

6. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to ask the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0025 to respond in writing to the allegations contained in the petition.

7. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to dismiss revocation petition 08-0026.

8. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold an informal revocation hearing for the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0027.

9. It was moved by Allen, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to hold an informal revocation hearing for the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0028.

10. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to hold an informal revocation hearing for the assessing officer named in revocation petition 08-0029.

11. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to have appropriate Assessment and Certification Division staff members appear at the informal revocation hearing for revocation petition 08-0028.

COMMUNICATIONS:

1. A communication from Ms. Dawn Nelson and Mr. Dale Nelson concerning the mandatory quiz established by the State Assessors Board for the 2007-2008 certification renewal period was reviewed by the Board.

2. A communication from Mr. Joe Turner concerning the mandatory renewal program established by the State Assessors Board for the 2007-2008 certification renewal period was reviewed by the Board.

3. A communication from Mr. Terry Eull concerning his time as a certified assessing officer was reviewed by the Board.

4. It was moved by McClelland, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to allow the certification of Mr. Gary L. Heckman to be reinstated for 2008 following payment by Mr. Heckman of penalty fees as specified in the Board's late renewal session completions policy/procedure.

OTHER BUSINESS:

1. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to adopt the proposed criminal conduct policy/procedure with the addition of language to include situations where an assessing officer has been convicted, pled no contest, or pled guilty to a felony and pending review by the staff of the Department of Attorney General.

2. It was moved by Patel, seconded by McClelland, and unanimously approved to approve the revised *Supervising Preparation of the Assessment Roll* document as presented.

3. It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved (1) to adopt the proposed official position on the levy, collection, and use of the property tax administration fee as presented and (2) to approve the proposed announcement of that official position as presented.

FIRST WORK SESSION:

1. The possibility of the Board adopting a statute of limitations on revocation petition matters was discussed by the Board.

2. The law regarding the retention of closed meeting minutes was discussed by the Board.

3. The Board discussed how best to provide training to level 4 candidates, that the level 4 demonstration narrative appraisal workshops now serve as a replacement for the Board's mentoring program, and that individuals should be encouraged to seek mentorships privately when writing demonstration narrative appraisals.

4. The possibility of adopting a 2009 meeting schedule at the August 2008 meeting of the Board was discussed.

MEETING RECESS: The meeting recessed at 12:15 p.m. for the day. The meeting reconvened at 9:00 a.m. on Tuesday, July 15, 2008.

ROLL CALL: Members present: Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson
Raman A. Patel, Vice Chairperson
Henry O. Allen, Member
Maxine J. McClelland, Member

Member absent: Frederick W. Morgan, Member (excused)

Staff present: David C. Lee, Executive Secretary

SECOND WORK SESSION:

1. The Board received an oral briefing from the Executive Secretary regarding the status of the new reporting system using Form 4620 and how this new system affects the timing of the Board's determination of over-certification situations.

2. The determination of unit level guidelines by the Board was discussed. Specifically, the need to alter the timing of this determination was discussed, as was the possibility of using more current value increase information than was possible previously.

3. The possibility of considering assessing officers not to be in an over-certification situation in circumstances where the assessing officer was not in an over-certification situation in the immediately prior year but, due solely to the growth in valuation of the unit(s) certified by the assessing officer and not due to the assessing officer now certifying more units than he or she certified in the prior year, the valuation certified by the assessing officer exceeds the amount specified for the assessing officer's level of certification; the Board discussed allowing a period of time for the assessing officer to become compliant with respect to the amount of value he or she certifies.

4. The Board discussed the possibility of increasing the amount paid by the Board for instructors of State Assessors Board Course 1 and Course 2. The possibility of developing a schedule of all such payments made by the Board was discussed. It was moved by Allen, seconded by Patel, and unanimously approved to pay \$1,500 per narrative appraisal to out-of-state graders participating in the narrative appraisal pilot project.

5. The Board discussed whether all certified assessing officers were subject to the revocation process. It was moved by Patel and seconded by McClelland to develop a position statement on the subject of whether assessing officers at all levels of the property tax system are subject to the certification revocation process. The motion was approved by a vote of three to one, with Allen voting in opposition to the motion.

ANNOUNCEMENTS: The next meeting of the State Assessors Board is scheduled for August 18 and 19, 2008 at 9:00 a.m. at the Michigan Assessors Association annual conference at the Grand Traverse Resort in Traverse City.

ADJOURNMENT: It was moved by Patel, seconded by Allen, and unanimously approved to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 10:02 a.m.

Date minutes typed: July 25, 2008

Date minutes approved: 8-18-08



Lisa A. Hobart, Chairperson